



ONE HAVERFORD CENTRE
361 WEST LANCASTER AVENUE
HAVERFORD, PA 19041
PHONE: 610-642-8500
FAX: 610-649-3633

STEVEN A. SCHWARTZ
SAS@CHIMICLES.COM

August 10, 2020

VIA ECF and EMAIL

The Honorable Valerie E. Caproni
United States District Court for the
Southern District of New York
40 Foley Square
New York, NY 10007
Email: CaproniNYSDChambers@nysd.uscourts.gov

Re: *Snitzer, et al. v. The Board of Trustees of the American Federation of
Musicians and Employers' Pension Fund, et al.*, No. 17-cv-05361-VEC

Dear Judge Caproni:

Per the Court's July 31, 2020 Order (ECF #188), I attach five charts providing additional information regarding Class Counsel's attorney fees and expenses.

The first chart provides the number of hours each attorney and legal assistant spent broken down in 14 different categories. The second chart provides a summary of the first chart along with a list of the most time-consuming tasks within each category. The third, fourth and fifth charts provide a breakdown of the expert fees paid to each expert, the travel expenses for each trip, and the cost per page for copying costs.

Please note that the meal expenses reflected in our Fee Motion and reflected in the travel chart reflects a 50% discretionary reduction for all meal costs billed to the case.

With respect to our copying costs, please note that the majority of our black and white copies did not involve straight copying of single documents, but related to making, on a quick turnaround, multiple copies of large sets of documents for depositions that had to be sorted and tagged with identification stickers or segregated into marked folders (to separate out working copies for the attorneys taking the depositions and clean copies to hand out to the witnesses and opposing counsel). Many of those copies also included printing out on 11"x14" or ledger paper various iterations of our master case spreadsheet which identified over 1,400 "hot documents" and more than 1,100 other documents deemed "highly relevant" with an accompanying digest and crosstabs for 40 different

The Honorable Valerie E. Caproni
August 10, 2020
Page 2

subject categories. *See* ECF #139 at ¶38. Many also included assembling the printed documents into binders.

Per Your Honor's instructions, this letter and the attached charts will be posted on the Settlement Website today.

Respectfully,

A handwritten signature in black ink that reads "Steven A. Schwartz". The signature is written in a cursive, flowing style.

Steven A. Schwartz

cc: All Counsel of Record (via ECF)

			Hours per category															
Name / Role	Status	Rate	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10	11	12	13	14	Total Hours	Lodestar
Schwartz, Steven A	P	\$825.00	53.90	63.50	126.70	9.40	78.50	306.40	6.30	672.90	496.40		116.70	11.90	374.20	241.90	2,558.70	2,110,927.50
Kriner, Robert J	P	\$825.00	358.60	139.10	82.70	5.00	280.20	336.55	46.80	719.50	331.40		156.90		96.00	129.60	2,682.35	2,212,938.75
DeSanto, Mark B	A	\$510.00		5.80	190.30	77.50	12.90	793.90		602.20	27.70	12.40	272.80		83.40	6.90	2,085.80	1,063,758.00
Belger, Vera G	FA	\$550.00	5.30	35.90	276.50	62.70	195.00	867.90	76.10	211.80	552.40		164.80		135.90		2,584.30	1,421,365.00
Berg, Tamara E	FCA	\$400.00						1,030.25									1,030.25	412,100.00
Chimicles, Nicholas E.	P	\$950.00			1.00			1.50							1.70	0.70	4.90	4,655.00
Donaldson-Smith, k	P	\$775.00														1.30	1.30	1,007.50
Mathews, Timothy N	P	\$725.00				0.30	0.20	0.60							0.50	0.70	2.30	1,667.50
Johns, Benjamin F.	P	\$700.00						0.90								0.30	1.20	840.00
Tucker, Scott M	P	\$650.00						0.60		1.40							2.00	1,300.00
Beatty, Zach	A	\$400.00			1.30		2.60	51.10									55.00	22,000.00
Cramer, Tiffany K	SC	\$575.00	91.60		4.80	0.90	23.90	129.60		113.60	10.90		20.50		48.50	3.30	447.60	257,370.00
Ferich, Andrew W	A	\$525.00			0.40			7.30	6.50					1.00	5.60	25.20	46.00	24,150.00
Holbrook, Samanatha	A	\$525.00				10.10					10.00		3.60				23.70	12,442.50
Kashurba, Alex M	A	\$450.00													15.80	12.50	28.30	12,735.00
McDonald Beena M	A	\$525.00			90.60		0.10	49.70								0.10	140.50	73,762.50
Skaug, Emily L	A	\$325.00									1.30					1.60	2.90	942.50
Boyer, Justin P.	PL	\$200.00			4.50					1.40					0.70	0.60	7.20	1,440.00
Landry, Madeline C	PL	\$200.00						1.80		47.00						0.40	49.20	9,840.00
Mastraghin, Corneliu	PL	\$250.00	4.70		19.50	8.20									16.00	3.70	52.10	13,025.00
Randolph, Dan	LA	\$200.00			2.00			18.00		38.00							58.00	11,600.00
Birch, David	IT	\$300.00						86.90			8.80				26.60	0.20	122.50	36,750.00
Bjotvedti, Nailah	LA	\$60.00			1.00			184.85									185.85	11,151.00
Haddad, Yasmine	FLA	\$70.00			1.00												1.00	70.00
Lingle-Titler Jessica	FA	\$400.00	0.70														0.70	280.00
Meyer, Harrison A	FLA	\$125.00				4.00		211.90									215.90	26,987.50
Naylor, Zach	FP	\$650.00	1.20		14.90			1.40									17.50	11,375.00
Tikellis, Pamela S	FP	\$895.00	3.80														3.80	3,401.00
Wagner, Ian M	FLA	\$70.00			0.70												0.70	49.00
Yarter, Ben	FCA	\$300.00						615.50									615.50	184,650.00
Hours			519.80	244.30	817.90	178.10	593.40	4,696.65	135.70	2,407.80	1,438.90	12.40	735.30	12.90	804.90	429.00	13,027.05	
Lodestar			401,533.50	189,848.00	489,927.00	94,477.50	424,736.50	2,205,701.25	89,075.00	1,655,852.00	1,015,462.00	6,324.00	469,165.50	10,342.50	557,229.00	334,906.50	7,944,580.25	
Categories			Grand Totals														13,027.05	7,944,580.25

1. Pre-complaint investigation/complaint
2. Court Hearings/Conferences/Status Reports/Pretrial Stipulations
3. Motion to Dismiss Briefing/Related Legal Research/Amended Complaint
4. All other legal research/motions/briefs
5. Discovery requests/responses/meet & confer negotiations
6. Fact analysis/document review
7. Class certification motion/briefs/legal research
8. Depositions and related preparations and legal/factual research
9. Experts/expert depositions/*Daubert* analysis/related fact/legal; research
10. Summary judgment motions/briefing/research
11. Trial preparation
12. Appeal research
13. Settlement negotiations/mediations/related legal/factual research through papering of MOU
14. Post Settlement - papering of agreement/OCIO/NIFT vetting/briefing of approval, objections/

Position

P = Partner

A = Associate

CA = Contract Attorney

LC = Law Clerk

PL = Paralegal

IT = Information Tech

FP = Former Partner

FA = Former Associate

FLC = Former Law Clerk

FPL = Former Paralegal

**Summary Chart of Time Spent by Category
with most Time-Consuming Tasks**

Code	Code Description	Hours	Percent of hours	Most time-consuming tasks
1	Pre-complaint investigation/complaint	519.80	3.99%	Review and analysis of over six years of Plan public filings and voluminous internal Plan documents obtained through a request by client under ERISA; Review and analysis of large volume of client documents and class member communications; legal research of claims for liability and damage; complaint drafting; emails/discussions with clients.
2	Court Hearings/Conferences/Status Reports/Pretrial Stipulations	244.30	1.88%	ESI, Protective Order and Case Management Order; Bi-Monthly discovery reports; case management reports; preparation for and participation in court hearings.
3	Motion to Dismiss Briefing/Related Legal Research/ Amended Complaint	817.90	6.28%	Analysis and legal and factual research related to initial motion to dismiss; legal research and draft amended complaint including incorporation of information from custodial files of Maureen Kilkelly; research and drafting opposition to motion to dismiss amended complaint and related argument preparation.
4	All other legal research/motions/briefs	178.10	1.37%	ERISA standards research for liability, damages, and evidentiary issue; insurance coverage research.
5	Discovery requests/ Discovery responses/meet & confer negotiations	593.40	4.56%	Drafting discovery requests directed to defendants and 15 non-parties including Meketa, Milliman, Plan counsel, Gallagher and various investment managers; negotiations concerning objections and scope of productions of defendants and non-

				parties and related legal research regarding potential motions to compel; responding to defendants document requests and production of thousands of pages of documents; related legal research over objections and discovery disputes and potential motions to compel.
6	Fact analysis/ document review	4696.65	36.05%	Review and analysis of: 204,778 pages of documents produced by Defendants; over 271,814 pages of documents produced by non-parties including an unorganized 100+ gigabyte database produced by Milliman; identification of over 1,400 "hot documents" and more than 1,100 additional documents deemed "highly relevant," which were each digested and segregated into approximately 40 different categories for use in the prosecution of the case; creation of chronological outline of all board and committee meetings and related minutes and analysis of drafts of minutes and counsels' notes of meetings; research on other ERISA pension plan cases.
7	Class certification /briefs/legal research	135.70	1.04%	Research and negotiations over whether a certified class is required for trial and appropriate class under Rule 23 for the claims; negotiations and briefing on stipulated non opt out class
8	Depositions and related preparations and legal/ factual research	2,407.80	18.48%	Preparation, legal research, factual research and travel for 25 depositions: Trustees Brockmeyer (two days), Rood (two days), DeMartini, Gagliardi, Greene, Hair, Johnson, Moriarity, Raphael, Thomas, and Yao, plus Plan Executive director Kilkelly; former Plan counsel Rory Albert and Penny Clark, three representatives of

				Meketa, three representatives of Milliman, representatives of Local 802 and Gallagher; Preparation and defense of depositions of Plaintiffs Snitzer and Livant; Parties marked almost 350 documents as deposition exhibits; digesting all depositions for use in mediation, summary judgment and trial.
9	Experts/expert depositions/ <i>Daubert</i> analysis/related fact and legal; research	1,438.90	11.05%	Facilitation of the preparation of the Witz report and rebuttal report of Witz, Mangiero and Pitts including work to obtain, decipher and clarify extensive Plan financial data and information generated by Meketa for the experts' reports; review and evaluation of opening and rebuttal reports of Borzi, Carron and Franklin; preparation for and taking and defending respective expert depositions; related legal research regarding expert <i>Daubert</i> issues and damages causation issues.
10	Potential summary judgment motions/briefing/re search	12.40	.10%	Legal research and preparation of submission to oppose Defendants' request to file summary judgment motion (the substantive work for that submission, particularly the chronology of imprudent investment decisions, is reflected in other categories).
11	Trial preparation	735.30	5.64%	Witness outlines; cross exam outlines; statement of uncontested facts (portions of the work related to an extensive set of uncontested facts reflected on other categories); evidence research and case outlines; analysis of other ERISA trials; pre-trial statements
12	Risk of appeal research	12.90	.10%	Research concerning potential appellate risks
13	Settlement negotiations/mediat	804.90	6.18%	All work related to mediation process and sessions and meetings

	ion process/related legal and factual research through documentation of Memorandum of Understanding			and communications with mediator and defense counsel; drafting mediation statements (including detailed chronologies of facts) and related mediation damages reports; research regarding damages and injunctive relief to evaluate trial prospects and risks; formulation of proposals and counter proposals; discussions with clients; analysis of other ERISA pension settlements; related discussions with our experts and clients.
14	Post Settlement Documentation of agreement/briefing of approval, objections	429.00	3.29%	Negotiation and drafting of settlement documentation; Court approval related briefing; evaluation and responses to objections; research and drafting of letter briefs regarding disputes regarding disclosure of discovery materials and issues raised by objectors; discussions with clients and class members; meeting with and vetting of proposed Neutral Independent Fiduciary Trustee and OCIO Monitor candidates; related discussions with our experts and clients.

Expert Expenses Report
Snitzer et al v. American Federation of Musicals Board of Trustees
Firm Name: Chimicles Schwartz Kriner & Donaldson-Smith LLP
Reporting Period: Inception to May 2020

	Cost
Bredh hoff & Kaiser PLLC	\$1,916.27
Dr Susan Mangiero / Fiduciary Leadership	\$124,328.34
David Pitts / Independent Actuarial Services	\$66,175.00
David Witz / Plan Tools	\$458,420.50
Ricoh	\$100.00
Transperfect Document Management	\$1,916.27
	\$652,856.38

Trip-by-Trip Travel Expense Report
Snitzer et al v. American Federation of Musicals Board of Trustees
Firm Name: Chimicles Schwartz Kriner & Donaldson-Smith LLP
Reporting Period: Inception to May 2020

Date	Place	Reason for Travel	Attorneys	Total Expenses
9/15/2017	NYC	Pretrial Conference	Steven Schwartz & Robert Kriner	\$722.84
4/24-4/25/18	NYC	Motion to Dismiss Hearing	Steven Schwartz & Robert Kriner & Mark DeSanto	\$1,272.89
8/8/2018	NYC	Mediation	Steven Schwartz & Robert Kriner & Mark DeSanto	\$628.32
8/26/2018	NYC	Livant Deposition and preparation meting	Steven Schwartz	\$744.36
10/9-10/10/18	NYC	Greene Deposition	Steve Schwartz & Robert Kriner	\$1,774.33
10/25-10/26/18	NYC	Snitzer & Kilkelly Depositions and Snitzer preparation meeting	Steve Schwartz (all) & Mark DeSanto (Kilkelly only)	\$1,651.01
10/29/2018	NYC	Brockmeyer Deposition	Steve Schwartz & Robert Kriner & Mark DeSanto	\$2,340.64
11/05-11/06/18	NYC	Rood Deposition	Steven Schwartz & Mark DeSanto	\$1,668.29
11/13-11/15/18	NYC	Thomas Deposition	Steven Schwartz & Robert Kriner	\$1,041.46
11/15/2018	NYC	Moriarity Deposition	Steven Schwartz & Robert Kriner	\$1,898.79
11/20/2018	DC	Clark Deposition	Robert Kriner & Mark DeSanto	\$285.63
11/28/2018	NYC	Hair Deposition	Steven Schwartz & Robert Kriner	\$807.66
12/5-12/6/18	LA	Rapheal & Yao Depositions	Steven Schwartz & Mark DeSanto	\$3,734.55
12/18-12/19/18	LA	Johnson & DeMartini Depositions	Steven Schwartz & Mark DeSanto	\$4,950.29
1/14-1/18/19	Boston	Spatrick Deposition	Steven Schwartz & Robert Kriner	\$1,971.69
1/14-1/18/19	NYC	Brockmeyer, Gagliardi & Local 802 designee Deposition	Steven Schwartz (all three) & Robert Kriner (just Brockmeyer)	\$3,306.96
1/28/2019	Boston	Meketa Deposition	Robert Kriner & Vera Belger	\$908.57
2/3-2/5/19	Boca	Lilly Deposition and change fees for cancelled mediation	Steve Schwartz	\$2,451.14
2/11/2019	NYC	Beher Deposition	Robert Kriner & Mark DeSanto	\$788.86
2/19-2/20/19	Mass.	Wallace Deposition	Robert Kriner	\$1,667.24
2/25-03/01/19	Chicago	Campe Deposition	Robert Kriner	\$866.94
2/26-2/28/19	Boston	Manley Deposition	Robert Kriner	\$1,438.43
02/28-03/01/19	NYC	Status Court Conference before Judge Valerie Caproni	Steven Schwartz & Robert Kriner & Vera Belger	\$1,648.93

Trip-by-Trip Travel Expense Report
Snitzer et al v. American Federation of Musicals Board of Trustees
Firm Name: Chimicles Schwartz Kriner & Donaldson-Smith LLP
Reporting Period: Inception to May 2020

Date	Place	Reason for Travel	Attorneys	Total Expenses
3/12/2019	NYC	Rood Deposition	Steven Schwartz	\$380.43
3/27/2019	NYC	Albert Deposition	Steven Schwartz & Robert Kriner	\$641.23
4/30/2019	NYC	Mediation	Steven Schwartz & Robert Kriner & Mark DeSanto	\$924.62
6/12/2019	NYC	Carron Deposition	Steven Schwartz & Robert Kriner	\$694.54
6/24-6/25/19	NC	Witz Deposition preparation	Steven Schwartz & Robert Kriner	\$5,902.58
6/28/2019	NYC	Franklin Deposition	Robert Kriner & Vera Belger	\$347.00
7/1/2019	Tenn	Pitts Deposition	Robert Kriner & Vera Belger	\$2,612.96
7/11 - 7/12/19	NYC	Status Court Conference before Judge Valerie Caproni	Steven Schwartz & Robert Kriner	\$1,244.38
7/17-7/18/19	DC	Borzi Deposition	Steven Schwartz & Robert Kriner	\$937.22
7/20-7/21/19	NYC	Mangiero Deposition and prepration meeting	Steven Schwartz (both) & Robert Kriner (just preparation)	\$3,832.68
1/9/2020	NYC	Mediation with JAMS	Steven Schwartz & Robert Kriner	\$592.30
1/14/2020	NYC	Meeting with Andrew Iriving and Defense Counsel	Steven Schwartz & Robert Kriner	\$569.74
		Miscellaneous Meals & Mileage		\$239.04
Total				\$57,488.54

Photocopy Expense Report
Snitzer et al v. American Federation of Musicals Board of Trustees
Firm Name: Chimicles Schwartz Kriner & Donaldson-Smith LLP
Reporting Period: Inception to May 2020

	Cost	# of Copies
B&W Copies @ .25 each	\$46,342.25	185,369
Color Copies @.50 each	\$2,872.50	5,745
Scanning @ .25 each	\$3,458.25	13,833
	\$52,673.00	204,947